

FINAL

**The Pennsylvania Citizen Law Enforcement Advisory and Review (CLEAR) Commission
Quarterly Meeting Minutes**

Tuesday, March 19, 2024, at 11:00 a.m.

(In person at Pennsylvania Commission on Crime & Delinquency and
Virtually *via* Microsoft Teams Platform)

At 10:30 a.m. Administrative Session

Christa Caceres, Commission Chairwoman, began an Administrative Session which included discussion of various administrative items and a review of the Commission's meeting Agenda.

At 11:03 a.m. Public Meeting Started and Recording Began

Chairwoman opened the meeting stating the date, time and made the audience aware that the meeting was being recorded.

At 11:04 a.m. Introduction of, and Roll Call by, Acting Secretary Commissioner Amy Zapp

Acting Secretary Commissioner Amy Zapp read the names of all Commission voting members aloud and those present whether in person or virtually responded by announcing their presence. All 10 voting members **(two had some technical difficulties and could not unmute to be heard when their names were called but could be seen as a participant, Commissioner Benjamin Lerner, and Commissioner Leon Ford)** were in attendance and a quorum of the Commission's voting members was met. A copy of the Roll Call and Attendance Form is attached [see Attachment 1].

At 11:06 a.m. Introduction of State Inspector General Lucas M. Miller

General Miller addressed the Commission with brief remarks.

**At 11:10 a.m. Opening Remarks by Commission Chairwoman and Introduction OSIG
Administrative Staff and Ex-Officio Members**

After Chairwoman Caceres gave her prepared opening remarks which included some personal background, she expressed how she envisions and hopes the Commission will move forward and how excited she is to get started on the work of the Commission.

Chairwoman Caceres acknowledged and thanked the ex-officio members for their partnership and for their service to the Commonwealth and allowed them the opportunity to share a few words. Those who spoke included:

- Representing the Office of the Governor: Deputy Chief of Staff Michael Pipe
- Representing the Office of General Counsel: Executive Deputy General Counsel Kelly Sekula
- Representing the Pennsylvania State Police: Captain Rob Brown

- Representing the PA Department of Conservation and Natural Resources: Deputy Secretary John Norbeck
- Representing the Pennsylvania Commission on Crime and Delinquency: Executive Director Michael Pennington
- Representing the Pennsylvania Department of Corrections: Secretary Laurel Harry
- Chief of the Capital Police: Joe Jacob (had some technical difficulties)

11:20 a.m. Introduction of Commission Members

Chairwoman Caceres introduced each voting member of the Commission, and each voting member gave brief remarks. All 9 members gave remarks.

11:30 a.m. Appointment of Commissioner Amy Zapp as Commission Secretary.

Chairwoman Caceres asked for a motion to accept the appointment of Acting Secretary Commissioner Amy Zapp to permanently appoint her as the Commission Secretary. Vice Chair Sonenshein moved to vote, Commissioner Wilson seconded the Motion. With no questions or discussion and a unanimous vote of all Commissioners, the appointment of Commissioner Amy Zapp as Secretary passed unanimously.

11:35 a.m. Motion to Adopt – *Bylaws of the Pennsylvania Citizen Law Enforcement Advisory and Review Committee.*

Chairwoman Caceres stated that the bylaws outline the rules and regulations that govern our Commission and guide our individual and collective responsibilities that will ensure our success. Commissioners were then asked by Chair Caceres if they had the opportunity to review the Commission’s proposed bylaws, all acknowledged that they had [***See attached draft copy of Pennsylvania Citizen Law Enforcement Advisory and Review Commission Bylaws***] Chair Caceres asked for a Motion to approve the draft of the Commission’s proposed Bylaws. A motion was made by Commissioner Rozel and seconded by Vice Chair Sonenshein. With no questions or discussion and a unanimous vote of all Commissioners, the Commission’s Bylaws have been adopted.

11:40 a.m. Formation of Commission Review Committees and participants

The Commission is authorized to review covered agencies completed internal investigative findings related to allegations of use of force and biased based policing in the following categories:

Critical Incident Committee: is charged with reviewing “all investigations of police-involved shootings resulting in injury of death of civilians by covered agencies”.

Critical Incident Committee Chair:

Commissioner Christa Caceres

Critical Incident Review Committee Members:

Commissioner Leon Ford

Commissioner Benjamin Lerner

Commissioner Amy Zapp

Use of Force Review Committee: *is charged with reviewing “a representative, random sampling of lower-level uses of force resulting in injury or death, including arrest and control techniques, baton strikes, and conducted energy weapon deployments”.*

Use of Force Review Committee Chair:

Commissioner David Sonenshein

Use of Force Review Committee Members:

Commissioner Jeffrey Wilson

Commissioner Francis Chardo

Commissioner Kevin Mahoney

Commissioner John Rozel

Bias-Based Policing Review Committee: *is charged with reviewing all investigations related to allegations of racial or ethnic discrimination and other bias-based policing or external complaints of bias or discrimination during interactions with covered agencies’ law enforcement efforts.*

Bias-Based Review Committee Chair:

Commissioner Kevin Mahoney

Bias-Based Review Committee Members:

Commissioner Christa Caceres

Commissioner David Sonenshein

Commissioner Charles Bailey

11:46 a.m. – Announcement of Future Quarterly CLEAR Commission Meetings

The week of June 18th – Pittsburgh, PA

The week of September 17th – Pocono Mountains, PA

The week of December 17th – Philadelphia, PA

11:48 a.m. – Public Comment

Chair Caceres opened the meeting to any Commission members and/or any guests in attendance or online. No public comments or guests spoke during this time.

11:49 a.m. – Public Meeting Adjourned

Public Session
3/19/24

Roll Call and Attendance Form

Type of Commission Meeting: Regular Specific Rescheduled

Date and Time of Commission Meeting: 3/19/24 11:00³a.m

Pursuant to Article 6, Sections 2 and 5 of the Pennsylvania Citizens Law Enforcement Advisory Commission's (CLEAR) Bylaws, I hereby attest to performing a Roll Call of Commission Membership at the above listed Commission meeting and recording attendance of Commission members as indicated below:

Name of Commission Member	Attendance		
	Present	Excused Absence	Absent
Christa Caceres	X		
David A. Sonenshein	✓		
Jeffrey Wilson	X		
Leon Ford	X		X
Dr. John Rozel	✓		
Benjamin Lerner	X		
Francis Chardo	X		
Amy Zapp	X		
Charles T. Bailey	X		X
Kevin Mahoney	X		

*

* Quorum
Noted

Amy Zapp
Signature of Christa Caceres, Amy ZAPP
Commission Chairperson
Acting Secretary